

令和 6 年 6 月 26 日現在

機関番号：14301

研究種目：基盤研究(C) (一般)

研究期間：2020～2023

課題番号：20K01445

研究課題名(和文) Electoral Coordination in a Multi-level Context: Analysis of Candidate Manifestos in Japanese Subnational Elections

研究課題名(英文) Electoral Coordination in a Multi-level Context: Analysis of Candidate Manifestos in Japanese Subnational Elections

研究代表者

Hijino Ken (Hijino, Ken)

京都大学・法学研究科・教授

研究者番号：90738311

交付決定額(研究期間全体)：(直接経費) 2,500,000円

研究成果の概要(和文)：日本の都道府県と市区町村レベルの議会選挙と首長選挙における選挙公報の体系的な収集、コード化、比較を通じて、マルチアリーナ選挙のダイナミクスを包括的に分析した。このデータセットに基づき、5つの分野に分けて分析を行った：1) 地方選挙の候補者がいつ、どのように選挙を「国政化」するのか、2) コロナ対策に対する知事選候補者のマルチレベル戦略、3) 知事選挙の対立次元と候補者のイデオロギー推定値と国政との比較、4) 人口減少と移住政策に関する言説テーマ、前提、争点について、全国レベルと自治体レベルの比較、5) 移住定住政策をめぐる市長選挙候補者のイデオロギー的方向性。

研究成果の学術的意義や社会的意義

Our findings about the multilevel strategies, ideological orientation, and conflict dimensions of candidates for subnational elections point to a range of implications for the quality of accountability, competitiveness, and responsiveness in Japan's democratic representation.

研究成果の概要(英文)：The project comprehensively analyzed multi-level electoral campaigning dynamics through the systematic collection, coding, and comparing of candidate manifestos at prefectural and municipal level for assembly and chief executive elections in Japan.

Based on this data set, I conducted analysis in five separate areas: 1) when and how gubernatorial candidates "nationalise" local elections; 2) strategies of blame avoidance and credit claiming in response to Covid-19 among gubernatorial candidates; 3) comparison of the conflict dimensions and ideological orientations of gubernatorial candidates in comparison with the national level; 4) comparison of the discursive themes, assumptions, and contestation for a key policy issue - rural in-migration - at both national and municipal level; 5) and the ideological orientation of municipal mayoral election candidates around the issue of depopulation and rural in-migration.

研究分野：Comparative Politics

キーワード：subnational elections manifestos multilevel second order decentralisation ideology depopulation rural politics

科研費による研究は、研究者の自覚と責任において実施するものです。そのため、研究の実施や研究成果の公表等については、国の要請等に基づくものではなく、その研究成果に関する見解や責任は、研究者個人に帰属します。

## 1. 研究開始当初の背景

Political parties which compete in multiple electoral arenas across different levels/branches of government face “coordination dilemmas”. That is, they must decide whether to “localize” or unify the party’s campaigning content across the many disparate elections they contest. A growing body of research has investigated such multi-arena coordination challenges (e.g. Detterbeck 2012, Golder et al. 2017).

Yet there are still research gaps in how and when individual subnational candidates, not just party organizations, adjust campaigning appeals strategically in a multi-arena context. The lacuna stems from the fact that the study of multi-level elections dynamics is based largely on the study of European parties with a focus on multilevel dynamics between party branches at different levels and territories.

Turning to Japan, aside from a few studies, multilevel coordination (and divergence) in campaigning between national, prefectural, and municipal co-partisan candidates have largely not been investigated. Thus, this research project proposed to focus on Japan and its subnational gubernatorial and mayoral elections, where candidates are generally more autonomous from party organizations.

In trying to quantify such divergence in party positions across regions, existing literature, primarily on European party systems, have compared party manifestos published at national and local levels (Cabeza et al. 2016, Pogorelis et al. 2013, Libbrecht et al. 2005). It therefore proposed, similarly, to create a data set of candidate manifestos for both prefectural and municipal assembly and executive elections, and to use it to understand the multilevel electoral coordination dynamics in Japanese politics.

## 2. 研究の目的

This project’s key goal was to elucidate what factors lead to greater convergence/divergence of campaigning content (in terms of policy emphasis, positions, and ideologies) of co-partisans vertically across different levels of government and horizontally across local governments at the same level. The research also sought to systematically test the conventional wisdom that Japanese subnational elections are de-politicized and lacking in programmatic competition. Finally, the research project aimed to uncover important normative implications for Japanese democratic representation. Voters struggle to effectively select as well as keep accountable representatives where co-partisans diverge in policy positions not only in the same electoral arena but also from other branches of the party, such as those of the national headquarters.

The project’s secondary goal was to generate a database that could be used for analysis of prefectural and municipal elections in general which could help answer such questions such as: how has local campaigning content over time changed? What are the territorial differences in the campaigning salience and position of specific policy areas? What kinds of language/discourse has been used on certain policy areas, in different regions and over time?

## 3. 研究の方法

The study was comprised of two stages.

In the first stage, I collected candidate manifestos from selected local governments at prefectural and municipal level through local election administration committees and public libraries as well as online digital sources. These were selected to provide variation in key characteristics such as local government size, urbanization levels, district magnitudes, and partisanship. These manifestos were digitalized and combined with various data on the individual candidates as well as the relevant specific election, electoral district, and local government. I collected and coded candidate manifestos with basic candidate and electoral data for some 1,350 prefectural assembly candidates and some 500 gubernatorial and mayoral candidates. In addition, I have also selected and completed a data set of "word score" reference texts and code of key terms to compare the ideological content of national with subnational candidate manifestos, along with a data set of speeches by party leaders at both levels.

In the second stage, I conducted quantitative and qualitative analyses using the collated data to analyze how the campaigning content of subnational candidates diverged or converged from their co-partisans at the national or sub-national level. Among the methods taken, I coded for various policy positions and multilevel strategies (such as when a candidate "nationalizes" subnational elections by referring to national-level policy, performance, or emphasizes personal linkages to the national government or makes statements which blame national levels for issues at subnational level). Correspondence analysis as well as "wordscore" methods were used to estimate dimensions of conflict as well as ideological clustering of different partisan candidates in gubernatorial and mayoral elections. I further conducted more in-depth analysis on two selected policy areas – response to Covid-19 and depopulation/rural-in-migration – and used the data set to conduct both quantitative and qualitative analyses focusing on ideological orientation and dimensions of conflict as revealed by the campaign discourse.

#### 4. 研究成果

Based on the above research goals, data set, and methods, I conducted analysis of five separate areas of multilevel coordination, which each form a separate article (three of which have been published and two pending publication). These five articles analyze: 1) when and how subnational candidates "nationalize" local elections (Hijino and Ishima 2021); 2) strategies of blame avoidance and credit claiming in response to Covid-19 among gubernatorial and national candidates (Hijino and Ishima 2023); 3) comparison of the conflict dimensions and ideological orientations of gubernatorial candidates in comparison with the national level (Hijino 2022, Hijino and Ishima 2023b); 4) comparison of the central discursive themes, assumptions, and contestation for a key policy issue - rural in-migration - at both national and municipal level (Hijino 2023b); 5) and the ideological orientation of municipal mayoral election candidates around the issue of depopulation and rural in-migration (Hijino 2023).

A description of the key findings for each of the above articles are as below:

1. Building upon studies on multi-level electoral dynamics, the article demonstrates how individual legislative candidates, and not just parties, selectively adopt what we call "cross-level electoral appeals"(CLEAs): campaign messages which emphasize issues, performances, and actors in levels of government other than that which the candidate or party is seeking office. Through regression analysis, we find evidence of national government party popularity leading to more frequency of local candidate CLEAs. We also find that local candidates who are more dependent on the party vote (i.e. those in smaller district magnitudes and in centralized party organizations) are more prone to certain types of CLEAs. (Hijino and Ishima 2021)
2. The article codes for different types of campaign appeals and responses to Covid-19, to

analyze which types of candidates are taking what kind of multilevel strategies (including appeals to unity, avoiding and shifting blame, claiming credit, or praising/criticizing national policy over Covid-19). The analysis finds few limited cases of blame shifting, credit claiming, and rallying among these subnational candidates. But regression analysis partially confirmed expectations about how incumbency and partisanship would influence these multilevel strategies. Both incumbents and challengers of various partisanship focused primarily on prospective rather than retrospective statements in their candidate manifestos concerning Covid-19. (Hijino and Ishima 2023)

3. This article captures the conflict dimensions and ideological orientations of gubernatorial candidates by investigating the campaign discourse of gubernatorial candidates both before and after the pandemic outbreak. We find that the language, and underlying ideological orientation, of these candidates can be separated into four clusters: “mainstream”, “old left”, “neo-liberal” and “fringe”. In addition, “regionalist” and “new left” populism can also be identified in select elections. The ideological orientations, as revealed by the discourse of candidates towards Covid-19 challenges, shows that the traditional left-right or progressive-conservative dimension of conflict is inadequate to fully understand the dynamics of subnational politics. (Hijino 2022, Hijino and Ishima 2023b)
4. This paper describes the political discourses around depopulation and measures to encourage in-migration from urban to rural areas in Japan. Using policy texts and campaigning material (national party manifestos and subnational candidate manifestos for mayoral elections), we uncover the central discursive themes, assumptions, and contestation over in-migration at both national and local level. In the ruling party discourse, non-Tokyo “regions” have potential and imperative to revive demographically and economically. These assumptions are largely unchallenged by opposition parties, aside from the communists, at national level. At local level, these goals to attract and retain youth to increase population are echoed by most mayoral candidates, where few voices challenge the claim that only with population growth can regions thrive. (Hijino 2023c)
5. This paper investigates how elected officials and candidates position themselves and contest issues concerning depopulation. Using campaign discourse, including candidate manifestos, it analyses the ideas driving politics in two policy areas related to shrinking populations: 1) various measures aimed at attracting young families and people to relocate to the municipality and 2) the closure and merger of public schools. The article maps the key ideas and assumptions driving policies to adapt and combat depopulation. We find two ideas – what we call “populationism” and “listenism” – prevalent in the discourse. In addition, we find contestation about depopulation largely disconnected from broader ideological debates about the role and size of the state, prioritizing community over individual interests, or being more open or closed as a community, etc. (Hijino 2023)

The normative implications from these research findings are diverse, but they can be broken into the two main points.

First, multilevel strategies which seek to “nationalize” subnational elections, including those which seek to divert or avoid blame for policy performance at local level onto national levels, were limited. But where they do occur tend to occlude accountability and responsiveness of subnational elections for policy and performance of subnational governments. Some partisan candidates were particularly and consistently using strategies to “nationalize” local contests, altogether unsuccessful electorally and correlated with actually lower voter turnout, suggesting these types of appeals do not lead to more competitive and attractive elections for voters.

Secondly, and more prominent a finding was that mainstream partisan candidates and independents for both prefectural and municipal elections tended to converge in both policy and

ideological orientation, as revealed by their campaign discourse. Thus, despite being parties at opposition in national level, at subnational level candidates backed by the very same parties tended to share the language and policy focus. In policy areas such as Covid-19 responses and dealing with depopulation, salient issues for local governments, mainstream candidates were largely undistinguishable. This convergence has implications for democratic competition and providing meaningful choice for voters. This ideological convergence among the major mainstream parties can maybe also investigated to understand the continued decline in voting turnout and interest in subnational elections generally.

## Bibliography

- Cabeza, L., Gómez, B., & Alonso, S. (2016). How National Parties Nationalize Regional Elections: The Case of Spain. *Publius: The Journal of Federalism*, 47(1), 77-98.
- Detterbeck, K. (2012). *Multi-level party politics in Western Europe*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Golder, S. N., Lago, I., Blais, A., Gidengil, E., & Gschwend, T. (2017). *Multi-level electoral politics: beyond the second-order election model*. Oxford University Press.
- Hijino, K. V. L., & Ishima, H. (2021). Multi-level muddling: Candidate strategies to “nationalize” local elections. *Electoral Studies*, 70, 102281.
- Hijino K.V.L. (2022) [Presentation] “Deviating” ideologies in Japanese gubernatorial elections.” VSJF (Vereinigung fuer sozialwissenschaftliche Japanforschung) annual conference. International conference presentation paper.
- Hijino, K. V. L. (2023). The politics of depopulation in Japanese municipalities: Ideas and underlying ideologies. *Contemporary Japan*, 1–22.
- Hijino, K.V.L. (2023b) [Presentation] “Urban rural migration in Japan and Europe: Transnational and comparative perspectives.” International Symposium hosted by GEAS FUB and JDZB. “The Politics of Attracting Residents to Depopulating Municipalities in Japan”. International conference presentation paper.
- Hijino, K.V.L. & Ishima, H. (2023). Blaming, Claiming Credit, or Rallying across Levels: Subnational Candidate Strategies during the Covid-19 Crisis in Japan. *選挙研究* 39. 1. 51-66
- Hijino, K.V.L. & Ishima, H. (2023b), [Presentation] “Ideologies in Japanese Subnational Elections: Textual Content Analysis of Japanese Gubernatorial Candidate Manifestos” EAJS (European Association of Japanese Studies) annual conference
- Libbrecht, L., Maddens, B., & Swenden, W. (2013). Party competition in regional elections: The strategies of state-wide parties in Spain and the United Kingdom. *Party Politics*, 19(4), 624-640.
- Pogorelis, R., Maddens, B., Swenden, W., & Fabre, E. (2005). Issue salience in regional and national party manifestos in the UK. *West European Politics*, 28(5), 992-1014.

## 5. 主な発表論文等

〔雑誌論文〕 計4件（うち査読付論文 4件/うち国際共著 3件/うちオープンアクセス 1件）

1. 著者名 Hijino Ken Victor Leonard	4. 巻 -
2. 論文標題 The politics of depopulation in Japanese municipalities: Ideas and underlying ideologies	5. 発行年 2023年
3. 雑誌名 Contemporary Japan	6. 最初と最後の頁 1~22
掲載論文のDOI（デジタルオブジェクト識別子） 10.1080/18692729.2023.2191478	査読の有無 有
オープンアクセス オープンアクセスではない、又はオープンアクセスが困難	国際共著 該当する
1. 著者名 Ken Victor Leonard Hijino and Hideo Ishima	4. 巻 Volume 70
2. 論文標題 Multi-level muddling: Candidate strategies to “nationalize” local elections	5. 発行年 2021年
3. 雑誌名 Electoral Studies	6. 最初と最後の頁 102281
掲載論文のDOI（デジタルオブジェクト識別子） 10.1016/j.electstud.2021.102281	査読の有無 有
オープンアクセス オープンアクセスではない、又はオープンアクセスが困難	国際共著 該当する
1. 著者名 Ken Victor Leonard Hijino	4. 巻 31
2. 論文標題 What drives Japanese regional elections? Multilevel factors and partisan independents	5. 発行年 2021年
3. 雑誌名 Regional and Federal Studies	6. 最初と最後の頁 419-432
掲載論文のDOI（デジタルオブジェクト識別子） 10.1080/13597566.2020.1840367	査読の有無 有
オープンアクセス オープンアクセスとしている（また、その予定である）	国際共著 該当する
1. 著者名 Ken Victor Leonard Hijino, Hideo Ishima	4. 巻 39.1
2. 論文標題 Blaming, Claiming Credit, or Rallying across Levels: Subnational Candidate Strategies during the Covid-19 Crisis in Japan	5. 発行年 2023年
3. 雑誌名 選挙研究	6. 最初と最後の頁 51-66
掲載論文のDOI（デジタルオブジェクト識別子） なし	査読の有無 有
オープンアクセス オープンアクセスではない、又はオープンアクセスが困難	国際共著 -

〔学会発表〕 計5件（うち招待講演 4件 / うち国際学会 4件）

1. 発表者名 Ken Victor Leonard Hijino
2. 発表標題 "Deviating" ideologies in Japanese gubernatorial elections
3. 学会等名 VSJF (招待講演) (国際学会)
4. 発表年 2022年

1. 発表者名 Ken Victor Leonard Hijino
2. 発表標題 The Politics of Attracting Residents to Depopulating Municipalities in Japan
3. 学会等名 Urban rural migration in Japan and Europe: Transnational and comparative perspectives" International Symposium hosted by GEAS FUB and JDZB (招待講演) (国際学会)
4. 発表年 2023年

1. 発表者名 Ken Victor Leonard Hijino
2. 発表標題 'Populationism' and the politics of depopulation in Japanese municipalities
3. 学会等名 Local Self-organization and Civic Engagement in Regional: DIJ Conference (招待講演)
4. 発表年 2023年

1. 発表者名 Ken Victor Leonard Hijino
2. 発表標題 The Politics of Repopulating Japanese Municipalities
3. 学会等名 International Political Science Association 2021 World Congress (国際学会)
4. 発表年 2021年

1. 発表者名 Ken Victor Leonard Hijino, Hideo Ishima
2. 発表標題 Ideologies in Japanese Subnational Elections: Textual Content Analysis of Gubernatorial Candidate Manifestos
3. 学会等名 European Association of Japanese Studies (招待講演) (国際学会)
4. 発表年 2023年

〔図書〕 計0件

〔産業財産権〕

〔その他〕

-

6. 研究組織			
氏名 (ローマ字氏名) (研究者番号)	所属研究機関・部局・職 (機関番号)		備考

7. 科研費を使用して開催した国際研究集会

〔国際研究集会〕 計0件

8. 本研究に関連して実施した国際共同研究の実施状況

共同研究相手国	相手方研究機関