

令和 5 年 4 月 16 日現在

機関番号：14701

研究種目：若手研究

研究期間：2020～2022

課題番号：20K20078

研究課題名（和文）Analysis of tourism guiding in pilgrimage: Model for perception of role of guides

研究課題名（英文）Analysis of tourism guiding in pilgrimage: Model for perception of role of guides

研究代表者

Progano Ricardo Nicolas (Progano, Ricardo Nicolas)

和歌山大学・国際観光学研究センター・特任講師

研究者番号：50860722

交付決定額（研究期間全体）：（直接経費） 1,400,000円

研究成果の概要（和文）：学術的研究目的は、成功に達成されました。また、スキルの不足、観光インフラの不足、ステークホルダーの調整など、地域の観光発展の課題に関するデータも発見されました。ただし、特定の制限がありました。まず、時間の制約により、一つのケーススタディのみがサンプリングされました。第二に、新しいフレームワークの作成は、先行研究が著しく不足しているため、範囲外であることが判明しました。従って、将来の研究が本研究プロジェクトを踏まえて、先の点に調査することが推奨されます。

研究成果の学術的意義や社会的意義

This study addressed the academic gap on religious figures as visitors guides.. Also, its results are of importance to local tourism stakeholders aiming to promote their heritage, as it touches upon themes related to visitor satisfaction in tourism guiding, and development challenges

研究成果の概要（英文）：This project's research achievements were reached successfully, as academic material on religious figures and tourism guiding was published after carrying out fieldwork. Also, information on the challenges related to local tourism development were found, such as lack of expertise, lack of tourism infrastructure and stakeholder coordination, among others. This provided additional data that helped to contextualize the main findings. However, certain limitations were found. Firstly, only was case study was sampled due to time constrains. Secondly, the creation of a new framework proved to be outside the scope due to the severe lack of previous research on the area. Following these limitations, it is recommended that future research expands upon the present research project and addresses these two points.

研究分野：Tourism

キーワード：Tourism Guiding Heritage Religion

### 1. 研究開始当初の背景

The Japanese government, through the Japan Tourism Agency, encourages tourism as a pillar of Japan's growth strategy, as well as the objective to move towards a tourism nation. At the same time, the Agency promotes the transition from mere sightseeing of cultural properties (such as temples) to engaging cultural activities where the visitors can directly interact with Japanese culture, as well as promoting tourism as a key element towards regional revitalization. In this context, Shugendo temples plays an important role by offering tourism experience program (修験体験) aimed at secular tourists who are guided by *yamabushi* guides through mountainous pilgrimage routes. These programs offer a unique tourism guiding grounded on physical activity and sacred rituals, forming a distinctive tourism experience different from leisure hiking. Still, academic research on guiding practices in pilgrimage context, such as Shugendo, is relatively lacking, forming a research gap.

### 2. 研究の目的

In order to bridge this gap, this research proposal aims to answer the following key scientific question: "How does a religious background of a guide modifies their perceived role during guiding?". To further explore this subject, this paper aims to analyze the role of *yamabushi* guides in Shugendō tourism experience programs. *Yamabushi* guides from Shippōryū-ji (七宝龍寺, Osaka prefecture), which offers experience programs, were sampled. Because of the exploratory nature of this research, a qualitative methodological approach was taken. Research will contribute to academic study on tourism commodification, certification, and guiding practices, and have practical implications for local stakeholders to understand and assess their guiding practices.

### 3. 研究の方法

Firstly, semi-structured interviews with Shippōryū-ji's religious authorities were carried out in Japanese during 2020 to further understand the contents of the experience programs, and how *yamabushi* guiding is understood and managed. The researcher's visits to Shippōryū-ji helped to identify gatekeepers and slowly gain their cooperation while obtaining information and doing in-site observations, in line with suggestions from previous research on fieldwork with religious organizations (Kawulich, 2005; Gregg & Scholefield, 2015). Understanding the temples' culture, as well as their stance towards both academic research and tourism was essential for the following fieldwork. In the researcher's experience, religious institutions may be distrustful of both academic and tourism organizations, as they regard them as 'outsiders' who do not have a deep knowledge of their traditions or seek to commodify their religion. Additionally, in Shugendō's case, it is believed that, instead of abstract discussions about religion, experience is the best way to obtain knowledge. In this regard, the researcher's previous participation in Shippōryū-ji's experience program in 2014 was valuable for establishing rapport with the temple's authorities. Additionally, Izumisano's Tourism Association, Cultural Heritage Preservation Division, and Board of Education were interviewed in 2020 to understand the Inunakiyama area's role in local tourism development and heritage preservation.

Next, on October 19<sup>th</sup>, 2020, the researcher participated in and completed the experience program to observe and understand the program's components and experience first-hand the different roles

undertaken by the *yamabushi*. This would allow understanding of any discrepancies in how the *yamabushi* perceive their roles and how they enact them, as well as to add overlooked details during the posterior interviews. This is important when interviewing members of a religious organization, who tend to speak from an 'official' viewpoint. Thus, to obtain complementary data, observation is a recommended method (Gregg & Scholefield, 2015). Observation also provided important points for constructing the interview protocol for sampled *yamabushi*. The researcher's role was not concealed, as the *yamabushi* were informed beforehand of his presence and research objective. During observation, the researcher adopted an 'observer as participant' stance, participating in the experience program, but focusing on data collection (Kawulich, 2005). After the observations of the experience program, field notes were taken to ensure the whole experience was not lost in memory (Muhall, 2003). The researcher adopted a salient hierarchy approach when writing field notes, giving priority to deviant or unexpected episodes (Wolfinger, 2002). Next, seven *yamabushi* who performed guiding during October 2020's experience program were interviewed in Japanese on 14 February, 2021. Before the interview, participants were handed an interview protocol explaining the research theme and the interview's purpose to obtain their informed consent. It is important to remark that only their role during the experience program was inquired about, as the perceived role of the *yamabushi* outside the experience program is not part of the research scope. As mentioned before, there are no systematic studies published on the roles of religious guides to rely on. Therefore, the seven *yamabushi* were asked an open-ended question, asking them to describe in detail what they thought were their roles during guiding and provide examples of this. They were also asked what they thought was the program's objective, as well as about any training requirements needed to guide during the experience program. Interviews were done in Japanese and recorded. The data was later transcribed into digital files by professional services to ensure quality. Thematic analysis was then utilized to identify common themes mentioned by the interviewees. This analysis was carried out with the assistance of the NVivo Plus 12 software, a CAQDAS (Computer Assisted/Aided Qualitative Data Analysis Software), to increase reliability and facilitate data management. To carry out the thematic analysis in a clear way, the applicant adopted the six-step thematic analysis suggested by Braun and Clarke (2006), which has been previously used for tourism studies. Finally, both findings from the fieldwork observation and thematic analysis were then discussed utilizing previous academic research on guiding (Cohen, 1985; Weiler & Davis, 1993; Howard, Thwaites & Smith, 2001; Pereira & Mykletun, 2015). Translated quotes from the participants are included to further illustrate the research findings.

#### 4. 研究成果

##### (1) Guiding roles

This research demonstrated the validity and importance of Cohen's (1985) pre-modern guiding roles for contemporary tourism in religious settings, although certain differences were noticeable. For instance, the *yamabushi* receive formal training from their seniors on rituals, mountain paths, and their religious meanings. As described by the *yamabushi* themselves, these teachings are based on oral traditions and mentor-student relationships. In contrast, pathfinders often rely on informal expertise (Cohen, 1985). Also, religious guides are not constricted to pre-modern roles, as they also adopted some of the other spheres described in previous literature, particularly the leadership sphere. Additionally, this research supports the importance of carrying out qualitative research from multiple sources and avoiding the sole reliance on interviews and questionnaires when researching religious institutions, because religious figures may speak

from an 'official' stance and leave other relevant data out, as described by Gregg and Scholefield (2015). Researchers should be aware of this point and utilize other sources of information, such as participant observations and written documents.

## (2) Service quality mechanisms

It was observed that *yamabushi* from Shippōryū-ji who act as guides in experience programs aimed at the public do not have service quality mechanisms as described in tourism literature (Mak et al, 2011; Weiler & Black, 2015). Delakorda Kawashima (2016)'s study showed a similar result, pointing out the lack of professional training and certification in religious guides. This lack of quality service mechanisms may negatively affect visitor experience and satisfaction during guiding. However, certain aspects of religious training and certification may show parallels to quality mechanisms. It can be argued that conserving the traditional training and certification organization of Shugendō would not only be of interest for the preservation of Izumisano's local heritage but also provide a competitive advantage towards other destinations. This research also showed the potential of applying strategic management and organization culture theories to the study of religious organizations in the tourism context to understand their service provision and competitive advantages. Since these organizations are becoming more interrelated with the tourism industry, the study of their organizational cultures would be of relevance to both academics and policymakers. For this, the application of organization culture and competitive advantage theories can offer a coherent framework for analysis and expand this understudied field (Tracey, 2012).

## (3) Practical implications

Regarding the study's practical implications, local governments related to tourism development may take into consideration the training and certification of religious organizations engaged in tourism activity, as well as their overall competitive advantage in the tourism market. In particular, religious organizations located in regional communities may be newly involved in tourism, and thus have little experience in hospitality and guiding aimed at tourists. While religious organizations are wary of interference from secular organizations in their internal affairs, local governments can offer non-compulsory guidance on visitor motivation and the tourism sector's structure and sustainability. Finally, study limitations should be addressed. Next, being aware of the roles that religious figures carry out during visitor activities such as the experience program is of importance for understanding what kind of guiding experience is being offered to visitors, and if their expectations are being met. Utilizing the framework described in the literature, policymakers can examine what kind of roles the religious guides are using.

## References

- Braun, V. & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3 (2), 77-101.
- Cohen, E. (1985). The tourist guide: The origins, structure and dynamics of a role. *Annals of Tourism Research*, 12, 5-29.
- Delakorda Kawashima, T. (2016). Travel agencies and priests as spiritual leaders: The merits of collaboration. *Tourist Studies*, 16 (1), 40-56.
- Gorai, S. (2008). *Mountain religion*. Tokyo: Kadokawa Bunko (in Japanese).

- Gregg, S. E. & Scholefield, L. (2015). *Engaging with living religion: A guide to fieldwork in the study of religion*. Abingdon: Routledge.
- Howard, J., Thwaites, R. & Smith, B. (2001). Investigating the roles of Indigenous tour guides. *The Journal of Tourism Studies*, 12 (2), 32-39.
- Kawulich, B. B. (2005). Participant observation as a data collection method. *Forum: Qualitative Social Research*, 6 (2) DOI:10.17169/FQS-6.2.466
- Mak, A.H.N., Wong, K.K.F. & Chang, R.C.Y. (2011). Critical issues affecting the service quality and professionalism of the tour guides in Hong Kong and Macau. *Tourism Management*, 32, 1442-1452.
- McGuire, M. P. (2013). What's at stake in designating Japan's sacred mountains as UNESCO World Heritage Sites? – Shugendō Practices in the Kii Peninsula. *Japanese Journal of Religious Studies*, 40 (2), 323–354.
- Muhall, A. (2003). In the field: Notes on observation in qualitative research. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 41 (3), 306-313.
- Miyake, H. (1966). Genjutsu in Shugendō: Its mechanism and world view. *Tetsugaku*, 48, 47-70 (in Japanese).
- Okamoto, R. (2015). *Pilgrimage to sacred sites: From World Heritage to anime setting*. Tokyo: Chūō Kōron Shinsha (in Japanese).
- Pereira, E. M. & Mykletun, R. J. (2012). Guides as contributors to sustainable tourism? A case study from the Amazon. *Scandinavian Journal of Hospitality and Tourism*, 12 (1), 74-94.
- Tracey, P. (2012). Religion and organization: A critical review of current trends and future directions. *The Academy of Management Annals*, 6 (1), 87-134.
- Yamanaka, H. (2017). Transformation of modern religion in consumer society. *Shūkyō Kenkyū*, 91 (2), 255-280 (in Japanese).
- Weiler, B. & Black, R. (2015). *Tour guiding research: Insights, issues and implications*. United Kingdom: Channel View Publications.
- Weiler, B. & Davis, D. (1993). An exploratory investigation into the roles of the nature-based tour leader. *Tourism Management*, 14 (2), 91-98.
- Wolfinger, N. H. (2002). On writing fieldnotes: Collection strategies and background expectancies. *Qualitative Research*, 2 (1), 85-95.

5. 主な発表論文等

〔雑誌論文〕 計1件（うち査読付論文 1件/うち国際共著 1件/うちオープンアクセス 1件）

1. 著者名 Progano Ricardo Nicolas	4. 巻 10
2. 論文標題 Roles of Religious Guides in Tourism: A Qualitative Study from Japan	5. 発行年 2022年
3. 雑誌名 International Journal of Religious Tourism and Pilgrimage	6. 最初と最後の頁 45-56
掲載論文のDOI（デジタルオブジェクト識別子） なし	査読の有無 有
オープンアクセス オープンアクセスとしている（また、その予定である）	国際共著 該当する

〔学会発表〕 計9件（うち招待講演 1件/うち国際学会 8件）

1. 発表者名 Progano, Ricardo Nicolas
2. 発表標題 Roles of religious guides in tourism: A qualitative study from Japan
3. 学会等名 Sacred Journeys 9th Global Conference（国際学会）
4. 発表年 2022年

1. 発表者名 Progano, Ricardo Nicolas
2. 発表標題 Shugendo Religion and Regional Development: The Case of Katsuragi Shugen Pilgrimage
3. 学会等名 International Religious Tourism and Pilgrimage Asia Pacific Conference（国際学会）
4. 発表年 2023年

1. 発表者名 Progano, Ricardo Nicolas
2. 発表標題 Rural communities and pilgrimage tourism development: Challenges for development.
3. 学会等名 Critical Tourism Studies - Asia Pacific Conference（国際学会）
4. 発表年 2023年

1. 発表者名 Progano Ricardo Nicolas
2. 発表標題 An analysis on the roles of religious guides - Japanese Shugendo as case study
3. 学会等名 CAUTHE 2021 (国際学会)
4. 発表年 2021年

1. 発表者名 Progano Ricardo Nicolas
2. 発表標題 Service quality mechanisms of religious tourism: An examination on Shugendo guides
3. 学会等名 EATSA 2021 (国際学会)
4. 発表年 2021年

1. 発表者名 Progano Ricardo Nicolas
2. 発表標題 Reflecting on the guide roles of religious figures
3. 学会等名 IRTP 2021 (国際学会)
4. 発表年 2021年

1. 発表者名 Progano Ricardo Nicolas
2. 発表標題 Religious stakeholders in tourism: Tradition as competitive advantage?
3. 学会等名 CAUTHE 2022 (国際学会)
4. 発表年 2022年

1. 発表者名 Progano, Ricardo Nicolas
2. 発表標題 修験体験における山伏の役目
3. 学会等名 日本宗教学会観光研究会（招待講演）
4. 発表年 2020年

1. 発表者名 Progano, Ricardo Nicolas
2. 発表標題 An analysis on the roles of religious guides- Japanese Shugendo as case study
3. 学会等名 CAUTHE（国際学会）
4. 発表年 2021年

〔図書〕 計1件

1. 著者名 Progano Ricardo Nicolas	4. 発行年 2022年
2. 出版社 Edward Elgar Publishing	5. 総ページ数 436
3. 書名 Pilgrimage tourism and the Shugendo programs in Japan (chapter in Handbook of Niche Tourism)	

〔産業財産権〕

〔その他〕

-

6. 研究組織

氏名 (ローマ字氏名) (研究者番号)	所属研究機関・部局・職 (機関番号)	備考
---------------------------	-----------------------	----

7. 科研費を使用して開催した国際研究集会

〔国際研究集会〕 計0件

8. 本研究に関連して実施した国際共同研究の実施状況

共同研究相手国	相手方研究機関
---------	---------